Civil Service Commission Minutes

Cincinnati, Ohio

March 24, 2011

The Civil Service Commission met in regular session in Room 307, Council Chambers, on Thursday, March 24, 2011. Commissioners in attendance were Mr. James Robinson, Chairman, Ms. Deborah Gaines, and Mr. Robert Braddock. Commission staff present included, Ms. Arnell Jackson, Assistant Civil Service Secretary and Ms. Ornita Brown, Recording Secretary.

Since minutes from the March 10, 2011 meeting had been circulated among the members, a motion to dispense with a reading of the minutes was passed and the minutes were approved as written.

ELIGIBLE LIST

Fire Specialist (Fire Prevention) – promotional Water Works Maintenance Worker (Article XX) – promotional

SPECIAL EXAMINER

- Michael Newport for the Maintenance Worker 1 exam (Board of Education)
- Alice Oliver and Saeid Mohammed for the Public Works Inspector 2 exam

DECISION

June Campbell

This matter came on for hearing before Commissioners Robert Braddock, Deborah Gaines, and James Robinson, chairperson. The Cincinnati Board of Education was represented by Attorney Daniel Hoying and the Appellant was represented by Attorney Karen Imbus.

The employee June Campbell was appealing her work suspension of five days effective December 6 to 10, 2010 for Incompetency, Inefficiency, Insubordination and Other. The Notice of Disciplinary Action was dated December 3, 2010. The Disciplinary Notice was the result of a disciplinary conference that was held on November 16, 2010 to address her failure to improve her unsatisfactory job performance.

The November 16, 2010 discipline conference was preceded by a disciplinary conference held October 5, 2010 regarding insubordination and threatening remarks made toward her supervisor resulting in a three day suspension (October 12,13, and 14,2010). Present at the conference with the employee was Betty Hodson, ACPSOP President and Edward T. Kathman, Attorney at Law. That disciplinary conference, included statements of frustration expressed by her supervisor regarding her failure to improve her performance as requested in the disciplinary conference of September 2, 2010 and also resulted in a change of assignment of supervisors but not job

responsibilities. It was also suggested that the employee should contact her physician to address any health concerns that she had expressed to her supervisor and others at Cincinnati Public Schools.

There had also been a disciplinary conference held September 2, 2010 regarding this employee's unsatisfactory job performance. Present with the employee at the September 2, conference was Betty Hodson, ACPSOP representative. Her supervisor David Durkin, Director Facilities Services stated his concerns regarding her job performance, including the following:

- 1. Incomplete work assignments;
- 2. Incorrectly completed work assignments;
- 3. Failure to communicate the status of your work assignments; and
- 4. Unprofessional behavior towards another employee (incident wherein she told a co-worker to "shut up").

After hearing the witnesses presented by the Board and the Appellant, the closing arguments of counsel, it is the finding of the Commissioners that the disciplinary action dated December 3, 2010 was progressive and appropriate. The appeal of June Campbell is denied and the action of the Board of Education is sustained.

METROPOLITAN SEWER DISTRICT

Request from the Metropolitan Sewer District for the temporary promotion of Paul Kaucher from a Senior Environmental Safety Specialist to a Supervising Environmental Safety Specialist

The staff recommended approval of the request. After review and discussion, the Commission approved the request. The decision was based on the fact that the incumbent is retiring and the temporary promotion is needed until the position can be filled permanently.

Request from the Metropolitan Sewer District for the temporary promotion of James Davis from a Senior Chemist to a Supervising Chemist

The staff recommended approval of the request. After review and discussion, the Commission approved the request. The decision was based on the fact that the incumbent is retiring and the temporary promotion is needed until the position can be filled permanently.

HUMAN RESOURCES

Request from the Human Resources Department for the promotion without exam of Lisa Auciello, Alexandria White, and Thomas Seward from Human Resources Analysts to Senior Human Resources Analysts

The staff recommended approval of the request. After review and discussion, the Commission approved the request. The decision was based on the fact that they have successfully completed three years of service as Human Resources Analysts.

CITY PLANNING AND BUILDINGS

Request from the City Planning and Buildings Department for the exceptional appointment of Otto Bauer-Nielsen Jr as a Buildings Plans Examiner

The staff recommended approval of the request. After review and discussion, the Commission approved the request. The decision was based on the fact that Mr. Bauer-Nielsen is qualified and the Commission previously approved this title for exceptional appointment.

EMERGENCY COMMUNICATIONS CENTER

Request from the Emergency Communications Center for the transfer of Mike Arnold from the Police Department as a Senior Computer Programmer Analyst

The staff recommended approval of the request. After review and discussion, the Commission approved the request. The decision was based on the fact that all parties are agreeable to the transfer.

Request from the Emergency Communications Center for the title change of Joseph Rusche, Kelvin Washington, Laura Vogel, Rita Boyd, Robert Metsch, Larry Arnold, Lucy Nguyen, Karla Williams, Rebecca Hopkins, Cara Van Steelandt, Theresa Hains, and Malcolm Allen Jr. from Fire Alarm Operator Dispatchers to Operator Dispatchers

The staff recommended approval of the request. After review and discussion, the Commission approved the request. The decision was based on the fact that the division is under reorganization and the Fire Alarm Operator Dispatcher position is obsolete.

AGENDA ITEMS

Request from Jasmine Wright to appeal her rejection from the Motor Equipment Operator 1 promotional exam

The staff recommended denial of the request. After review and discussion, the Commission denied the request. The decision was based on the fact that Ms. Wright does not meet the minimum qualifications.

Request from Joseph Charlton to appeal his rejection from the Assistant Treatment Superintendent exceptional appointment process

The staff recommended denial of the request. After review and discussion, the Commission approved the request. The decision was based on the information provided at the meeting.

Request from the Parks Department to add a Facility Maintenance Specialist, Florist, and Senior Architect position to their table of organization

The staff recommended approval of the request. After review and discussion, the Commission approved the request. The decision was based on the fact that the duties and responsibilities are consistent with the proposed titles and the deletion of a Senior Engineer.

Request from Enterprise Technology Services to add a Senior Computer Programmer Analyst and two Computer Systems Analyst positions to their table of organization

The staff recommended approval of the request. After review and discussion, the Commission approved the request. The decision was based on the fact that the duties and responsibilities are consistent with the proposed titles.

Request from the Metropolitan Sewer District to add a Utility Technician position to their table of organization

The staff recommended approval of the request. After review and discussion, the Commission approved the request. The decision was based on the fact that the duties and responsibilities are consistent with the proposed title and the deletion of a Utility Laborer.

Information Items from March 10, 2011

Request from the Health Department to use the exceptional appointment process to fill a Health Counseling Supervisor position.

Request from the Finance/Income Tax Division and Water Works Department to use the exceptional appointment process to fill a Supervising Accountant position.

The above two items will be held for 45 days for questions or concerns.

Information Item from February 10, 2011 – APPROVED

Request from the Parks Department to use the exceptional appointment process to fill a Supervising Management Analyst position.

Appeals to be scheduled:

Joseph Lee

James Roper

David Johnson

Augusta Steele

LaNita McDonald

Anthony Arnold

Charles Martin II

Alfred Brewster

Veno Mitchell

Joe Harrison Jr.

James Jackson

David Boggs

Timothy Ratcliffe